North Carolina Benchmarking project

BENCHMARKING 2.0
MUNICIPALITIES

Webinar
National Academy of Public Administration
Thursday, January 18, 2024
Obed Pasha, PhD.

Associate Professor

Director of the North Carolina Benchmarking Project (Since 2022)

School of Government, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Organizational Behavior: Strategic Planning and Performance Management

Email: pasha@unc.edu
Benchmarking 2.0 Team

Obed Pasha
Associate Professor of Public Management
School of Government
UNC-Chapel Hill
pasha@unc.edu

Dania Khan
Project Coordinator
UNC-Chapel Hill
kdania@ad.unc.edu

Caitlin Lancaster
Project Assistant (Municipalities)
UNC-Chapel Hill
calanca4@email.unc.edu

Jordan Haber
Graduate Assistant
UNC-Chapel Hill
haberj@ad.unc.edu

Melissa Cordell
Graduate Assistant
UNC-Chapel Hill
meidel@live.unc.edu

Reilly Stahl
Senior Graduate Assistant
UNC-Chapel Hill
reillyy@live.unc.edu

Keegan Huynh
Project Assistant
UNC-Chapel Hill
keeganh@unc.edu

Jenna Kubiak
Graduate Assistant
UNC-Chapel Hill
jennakub@unc.edu

Layne Cole
Graduate Assistant
UNC-Chapel Hill
ccol@unc.edu
Overview
Established in 1995

Compiling service and cost information

Comparison over time and with peers

Eleven (11) services

~10 NC Municipalities
SERVICES

Solid Waste
Asphalt Maintenance
Fleet Maintenance
Parks and Recreation
Water Service
Wastewater Service
Police Service
Emergency Communications
Fire Service
Building Inspections
Central Human Resources
Apex, Chapel Hill, Charlotte, Concord, Goldsboro, Greensboro, Hickory, Raleigh, Wilson, Winston-Salem
In 2022, we took the opportunity to make fundamental changes

Keep up with latest research and practice

Make the project even more relevant and useful for partners
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Legacy Benchmarking Project</th>
<th>Benchmarking 2.0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>Costing, Budgeting, and Performance</td>
<td>Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus</td>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>Service Delivery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metrics</td>
<td>Activities and Cost</td>
<td>Outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Collection</td>
<td>Excel Profile Forms</td>
<td>Online Data Collection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis and Reporting</td>
<td>Printed Reports</td>
<td>Flexible Dashboards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Used For</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Conversations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departmental Interactions</td>
<td>Few</td>
<td>Intense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Best Practice Development</td>
<td>Sporadic</td>
<td>Regular</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PURPOSE

Shared learning and community building

Performance improvement of service departments
THIS PROJECT IS **NOT** MEANT FOR...

- Accountability
- Finger-pointing
- Gotcha!
- Competition
FOCUS ON...

- Learning
- Strategizing
- Finding root causes
- Solving underlying issues
- Having conversations
PARTICIPATING MUNICIPALITIES

2022: Ten (10)

2023: Fourteen (14)

2024: Eighteen (18)

Restrict participation to Twenty (20)

Option of partial participation (only data sharing)
Apex, Chapel Hill, Charlotte, Concord, Goldsboro, Greensboro, Hickory, Raleigh, Wilson, Winston-Salem

New: Asheville, Holly Springs, Kannapolis, Rocky Mount, Wake Forest, Gastonia, and Salisbury
BENCHMARKING 2.0 @NAPA

Process
Project Timeline (Annual)

August
- Kick-off Data Collection

September
- Data Collection Complete
- Audit Phase I: Compare with own performance
- Audit Phase II: Compare with normalized data from partners

October–November
- Dashboard (November 1)
- Performance Strategy Sessions
Dashboard
Concord

Asheville, Chapel Hill, Greensboro, Hickory, Raleigh

Fire Service
- Incidents
- Incidents per population
- Fires percent of incident (x100)

Asphalt Maintenance
- Population per Lane Mile
- Total AMR expenses per Lane Mile

Police
- Population served per Approved Sworn Officer FTEs
- System Calls dispatched per Approved Sworn Officer FTEs
- Reported Larcenies per Approved Sworn Officer FTEs (Average - All)
- System Calls dispatched per Approved Sworn Officer FTEs (Average - All)

Download Graph
BENCHMARKING 2.0 @NAPA

Performance Strategy Sessions
PERFORMANCE STRATEGY SESSIONS: 2022

11 performance strategy sessions with service departments

Over 190 participants

3-hour open- and guided-discussions hosted at the SOG

- Challenges
- Innovations
CHALLENGES IN COMMON (EXAMPLES)

**Internal**
- Hiring
- Turnover and Retention
- Funding and Inflation

**External**
- Managing resident and council expectations
- Changing needs and services
GREENSBORO TAKEAWAYS (EXAMPLES)

- **Asphalt Maintenance and Repair**: All other cities using the same software except Greensboro

- **Water Service**: Greensboro’s on-the-spot hiring gained a lot of interest from other municipalities
What are the challenges in moving to bi-weekly payments?

Two municipalities bringing solid waste back to direct delivery

Fire departments sharing concerns about not being included in planning discussions

How 55” screens are helping plan reviewers

How “recognized neighborhood” plans are helping parks and recreation departments identify the needs of underserved populations

How come Uber knows your exact location but your emergency response team doesn’t?
Feedback on the Sessions

Very positive and encouraging

• Learn
• Understand
• Network

Room for Improvement

• Sessions too short (should be an entire day instead)
• More data analysis
• Deep dive into specific topics
Performance Strategy Sessions: 2023

11 performance strategy sessions with service departments

3-hour structured discussions

233 participants

Highest participation numbers: Fire Service, Police Service, and Parks and Rec
Performance Strategy Sessions: 2023

- What Data Do You Use To Make Decisions?
- How Do You Analyze Data?
- What Decisions Do You Make?
- What Are Your Other Data Needs?
Performance Strategy Sessions: **Big Picture**

- **2022**
  - **Last Year:** Challenges and Innovations

- **2023**
  - **This Year:** Decision Making

- **2024**
  - **Next Year:** Outcomes and Promising Practices

- **2025**
  - **Onward:** Data Analysis and Problem-Solving

*Benchmarking 2.0 Municipalities*
Future Direction
Alamance, Buncombe, Cabarrus, Durham (EMS only), Gaston, New Hanover, Pasquotank, Rutherford, and Wake (partial)
County Departments

Budgeting and Finance
Building Inspections, Permits, and Plan Review
Central Human Resources
Communication and Public Relations
Emergency Communications
Emergency Medical Services
Information Technology
Facilities Maintenance
Fleet Maintenance
Departments to be added in 2024

- Animal Services
- Child Protective Services
- Elections Administration
- Public Health Services
- Public Library
- Tax Administration
North Carolina Benchmarking project

BENCHMARKING 2.0
UTILITIES
Utilities Benchmarking

- Data collection from over 200 water and wastewater utilities in NC using our framework
- Combine data with the UNC Environmental Finance Center (EFC) dashboard (rates, finance, etc.)
- GIS maps
- Separate water and wastewater utilities report
In Conclusion..
Focus
- Data Analysis
- Problem Solving

Tools
- Dashboard
- Performance Sessions

Projects
- Municipal Benchmarking
- County Benchmarking
- Utilities Benchmarking

SCHOOL OF GOVERNMENT
North Carolina Benchmarking Project
BENCHMARKING 2.0 @NAPA

Q&A