**Joint International Affairs and Social Equity Standing Panel Meeting 3.2.23**

What can be learned from comparative (cross-country) Covid governance?

Blue Wooldridge

* PowerPoint is shared on webpage
* Read all about it: NAPA Social Equity in Governance <https://napawash.org/working-groups/standing-panels/social-equity-in-governance>
* About Dr. Wooldridge's distinguished career, <https://wilder.vcu.edu/people/faculty/blue-wooldridge.html#:~:text=Wooldridge%20teaches%20courses%20in%20public,analysis%2C%20and%20formulation%20and%20implementation>
* NAPA Standing Panel on Social Equity honors the work of Phil Rutledge, <https://napawash.org/award-programs/the-philip-j-rutledge-social-equity-leadership-award>
* More about Philip Rutledge as a pracademic, <https://blogs.iu.edu/oneillschool/2023/02/24/philip-rutledge-a-pracademic-who-continues-to-serve-as-a-role-model/comment-page-1/>
* Join us for the 2023 Social Equity Leadership Conference, June 12-14, 2023 <https://napawash.org/events/2023-social-equity-leadership-conference-social-equity-in-action>
* See featured session from our 20th Annual Social Equity Leadership Conference hosted during the pandemic, <https://napawash.org/events/social-equity-leadership-conference>
* We are always so thankful for the support of the Social Equity Leadership Conference. Interested in sponsorship? <https://www.enrole.com/kupmc/jsp/course.jsp?categoryId=3C8FE798&courseId=SELC-NAPA>
* Richard Wilkinson, Ted Talk has been viewed by 3.8 million people, <https://www.ted.com/talks/richard_wilkinson_how_economic_inequality_harms_societies?language=en>

Dr. Louise Comfort and Dr. Mary Lee Rhodes

* Collective cognition
	+ Emerges from shared knowledge and experience
	+ Relies on timely and valid communication among actions
	+ Ex: April 6, 2020, 4.6 billion people on planet stayed in their homes to stop transmission of COVID-19
	+ Often required for us to address global problems
* Complex adaptive systems
	+ One country acts and it changes the environment, which affects another country, continual interactions within this system
* The use of information tech varied across cases and communication both positively and negatively affected collective cognition (misinformation, varied paths)
* ICT use in South Korea was sophisticated and comprehensive because of their past using it
	+ There were concerns around privacy
* US varied state to state- had completely different rules across jurisdictions
	+ Some states came together to make regional rules because states that were near each other were impacted by each other's rules (or lack of)
* Signaling via images was culturally embedded (used widely)
	+ Varying ways to communicate the danger and how people should act
* Engagement with community and NGO actors was high in Japan and Ireland

Resources Related to Dr. Comfort and Dr. Rhodes

* Learn more about Louise Comfort: https://napawash.org/fellow/10873
* "Shared Risk" by Louise K. Comfort (1999), <https://books.google.com/books/about/Shared_Risk.html?id=BqmDQgAACAAJ>
* Read all about Collective Cognition by Mary Lee Rhodes and Louise Comfort, <https://www.google.com/books/edition/Global_Risk_Management/GGWFEAAAQBAJ?hl=en&gbpv=1&dq=collective+cognition+louise+k+comfort&pg=PT221&printsec=frontcover>
* See also Comfort (2007) "Crisis Management in Hindsight" https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1540-6210.2007.00827.x
* A real master-class with Dr. Louise K. Comfort, an expert in decision-making crisis, disaster preparedness and use of technology <https://theconversation.com/profiles/louise-k-comfort-1260844>

Resources Related to Dr. Rhodes

* Learn more about Mary Lee Rhodes: <https://www.tcd.ie/research/profiles/?profile=RHODESML>
* Connecting with the Dr. Mary Lee Rhodes, Co-Director of Trinity Centre for Social Innovation, <https://www.linkedin.com/in/mary-lee-rhodes-3026013/>
* Read more about connecting nature through innovate platforms and networks, from Dr. Rhodes <https://connectingnature.eu/member/mary-lee-rhodes>
* See the WHO Republic of Korea dashboard, <https://covid19.who.int/region/wpro/country/kr>
* See the WHO Ireland dashboard, <https://covid19.who.int/region/euro/country/ie>
* See the WHO Japan dashboard, <https://covid19.who.int/region/wpro/country/jp>
* Learn more about the global efforts, measures, data, other resources <https://covid19.who.int/>
* See the WHO dashboard for Italy, <https://covid19.who.int/region/euro/country/it>
* World Health Organization reporting 6,859,093 deaths on the WHO Coronavirus (COVID-19) Dashboard <https://covid19.who.int/>

Access to Dr. Comfort and Dr. Rhodes’ Book

* Read Chapter 1 of Dr. Comfort and Dr. Rhodes' book: [Global Risk Management; The Role of Collective Cognition in response to Covid-19 (2022).](https://nam12.safelinks.protection.outlook.com/?url=https%3A%2F%2Ffiles.constantcontact.com%2F50bfb0e3801%2Fd7cb6dce-cfff-47c2-8748-d335289be1a8.pdf%3Frdr%3Dtrue&data=05%7C01%7Clkc%40pitt.edu%7C3b895b75c68b46cf9bf008db15e74788%7C9ef9f489e0a04eeb87cc3a526112fd0d%7C1%7C0%7C638127855755506915%7CUnknown%7CTWFpbGZsb3d8eyJWIjoiMC4wLjAwMDAiLCJQIjoiV2luMzIiLCJBTiI6Ik1haWwiLCJXVCI6Mn0%3D%7C3000%7C%7C%7C&sdata=W6tV%2BqpvlgYG%2Fr%2F2mkXY6D6DdOZ4656E%2FHf1FrmGTdY%3D&reserved=0)
* Access the entire book here: <https://www.taylorfrancis.com/books/edit/10.4324/9781003253280/global-risk-management-louise-comfort-mary-lee-rhodes>

Comments During Presentation

* Blue Wooldridge : Drilling down from the National level, how does Collective Cognitive differ from demographic identity Groups, ie economic class, etc?
* Jennifer Widner : Here are some more cases my program developed. Communication plays a role in these cases but is not the main focus. Possibly of use in extending the range of the series. https://successfulsocieties.princeton.edu/focus-areas/pandemic-response
* Daniel Guttman : Wonderful-from my first reads, my “naive” hypothesis is that there can be substantial value in comparing the “governance” focus we have been developing with what ADB and the Banki Moon Adaptation group have been doing-including using the governance work we have been doing as “checklist”

Dr. Elsie Harper-Anderson

* Access to care and economic hardship was unevenly distributed and more heavily affected those who already suffered from racial injustice
* Susan Gooden pushed for creation of Action Plan, and developed for 4
	+ Policy and practice (got rid of GRE score requirements)
	+ Student support (more outreach to vulnerable populations)
	+ Teaching and curriculum
	+ Research and scholarship (creation of this book)
* There were not local emergency management plans for lower income areas because a lot of times these plans are developed by consultants and those cost $

Resources Related to Dr. Harper-Anderson's Presentation

* Read about Dr. Harper-Anderson: <https://wilder.vcu.edu/people/faculty/elsie-harper-anderson-.html>
* Purchase Racial Equity, COVID-19, and Public Policy: The Triple Pandemic at this link: <https://www.routledge.com/Racial-Equity-COVID-19-and-Public-Policy-The-Triple-Pandemic/Harper-Anderson-Albanese-Gooden/p/book/9781032261782>
* Social Equity in Action #FollowUs to the L. Douglas Wilder School of Government and Public Affairs, <https://wilder.vcu.edu/about/>
* Wilder School Racial Equity Action Plan, read all about it: <https://wilder.vcu.edu/news-and-events/racial-equity-action-plan/>
* See Section IV. Research and Scholarship of the Wilder School Racial Equity Action Plan (REAP), <https://wilder.vcu.edu/media/wilder/documents/REAPReport_updated12.7.2020.pdf>
* Read All About It: Use this discount code for 25% off on eBook, to request eBook inspection copy, or to preview Racial Equity, COVID-19, and Public Policy: The Triple Pandemic edited by Harper-Anderson, Albanese, and Gooden (2023) <https://www.routledge.com/Racial-Equity-COVID-19-and-Public-Policy-The-Triple-Pandemic/Harper-Anderson-Albanese-Gooden/p/book/9781032261782>
* More about COVID-19 in Virginia, <https://www.vdh.virginia.gov/coronavirus/>

Comments During Presentation

* In Japan, the rescue policy for small business was very limited and indeed shop owners are now asked to pay back their loan to survive during the pandemic. There is no disaggregated data to look into the racial disparity in numbers but I consider the inequity observed here may be observed in Japan too (often this is not discussed).

Harald Schmidt

* US focused on helping those who were the worst off
	+ Made sense to identify them because they were more likely to die or not economically bounce back
* UK has not used vulnerable populations for vaccine allocation
* Even in the absence of high-level prioritization of equity in vaccine allocation and testing, people in lower levels pushed for equitable practices
* And empirical data on (strong) association between disadvantage and covid incidence and deaths: <https://ajph.aphapublications.org/doi/10.2105/AJPH.2022.307018>
* California also one of leaders of using disadvantage indices in lockdown and vaccines: <https://www.healthyplacesindex.org>

Dr. Harald Schmidt

* Dr. Harald Schmidt is an Assistant Professor of Medical Ethics and Health Policy at the University of Pennsylvania, focused on advancing equity in resource allocation and health promotion. He has led work on using disadvantage indices to achieve more equitable Covid-19 vaccine rationing in the US, adopted by the majority of US states (for a comparative overview of all US states see: https://www.nature.com/articles/s41591-021-01379-6 cf also use by the WHO for health emergencies more generally: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240031852). With colleagues, he also made practical proposals to reduce inequitable outcomes from ventilator rationing (see: https://jme.bmj.com/content/48/2/126) He works with policy makers at the state, federal and international level (WHO) to leverage insights from comparative analyses for advancing health equity.

Wenjuan Zhang

* Wenjuan Zhang is Professor and Associate Dean (International Collaborations) of Jindal Global Law School (on leave) and she helped found the Center for India-China Studies, O.P. Jindal Global University in India. She is currently an Asia Fellow of Ash Center for Democratic Governance and Innovation, Harvard Kennedy School. Read more here: <https://ash.harvard.edu/people/wenjuan-zhang>

Links Shared during Dr. Schmidt and Wenjuan Zhang’s Introductions

* See now the CDC/ATSDR Social Vulnerability Index for measures of human suffering and economic loss, <https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/placeandhealth/svi/index.html>
* Read all about it: GAO-21-319 Operation Warp Speed, <https://www.gao.gov/products/gao-21-319>
* Read all about USA FEMA Vaccine Support, also CDC recommendation about "who should be vaccinated first" <https://www.fema.gov/disaster/coronavirus/vaccine-support>
* More FEMA News & Multimedia "FEMA Takes Action to Ensure Equity in Vaccine Distribution" (Feb 2021) <https://www.fema.gov/blog/fema-takes-action-ensure-equity-vaccine-distribution>
* In Science, "1.3 billion people. A 21-day lockdown. Can India curb the coronavirus?" <https://www.science.org/content/article/13-billion-people-21-day-lockdown-can-india-curb-coronavirus>
* For those interested, two more links on the entirely unprecedented use of disadvantage indices in vaccine allocation (as well as test allocation, and ventilator allocation)
	+ Why prioritizing by disadvantage is right on economic, ethical and epidemiological grounds, promoting both social and racial justice: “Vaccine Rationing and the Urgency of Social Justice in the Covid‐19 Response” <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/hast.1113>
	+ More on nuts and bolts “Covid-19: how to prioritize worse-off populations in allocating safe and effective vaccines” <https://www.bmj.com/content/371/bmj.m3795>
* Read also Desmon (Jan 2023) at Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, "A new COVID Landscape in China" <https://publichealth.jhu.edu/2023/no-more-lockdowns-chinas-new-covid-landscape>

Q & A Session

* Louise: Policy changes don’t work unless there is collective cognition
	+ Los Angeles couldn’t run unless they had essential workers at work, and so they made sure to protect them
* Mary Lee: we use deprivation indices in Ireland, but it doesn’t include race or religion, which would create a political backlash in trying to protect the vulnerable
	+ Deprivation indices were used in the US as well
* Elsie: Having key leadership on the ground has lots of policy impacts
	+ Leader must create transparency, be driven by the data; this is vital for trust
	+ “Many truths were being told”
* Harald: when is the right time to “learn lessons”; no one likes to discuss
* Irving: having leadership that is willing to learn from other governments is important
* Yoshitaka: shopkeepers are being told to pay back COVID-19 loans, but this might make them lose their businesses
	+ Death and economic suffering are intrinsically connected; they shouldn’t be seen as two separate choices in policy design
* Xuefei Ren: I am doing comparative work in Toronto, Chicago, and Johannesburg
	+ I didn’t realize that US had pretty good data; mayor’s office was motivated to address equity gap because the data showed disparities
	+ Reluctancy in UK and Canada to collect racial data
* Arnie Fields: we can relate to others through our common pursuit of life
	+ Trust is vital for public administration and policy
* Blue: I wish we could ignore race, but we cannot, equity is the most important pillar of public administration
* Dan: What are the Next Steps?
	+ Perhaps we can brainstorm a following session on comparing data, data analysis, communication of this data to the broad public

Comments During Q&A Session

* Yoshitaka Ota : Thank you Dr. Berry James. Very helpful
* Stephen Pellegrino : Just mentioned, with respect to data, both earlier speakers mentioned California vs Florida. How did the "emergent outcomes" seem to differ for both? Are there best practices to be gleaned from the experience? How much have we learned about the strategies we've taken so far (and will take the next time)? How do we best balance a collective cognitive top down policy and still encourage the local, bottoms up freedom to innovate to educate the policy with "comparative learning"? Can non-equity based local solutions still inform top down solutions?
* Harald Schmidt : And empirical data on (strong) association between disadvantage and covid incidence and deaths: <https://ajph.aphapublications.org/doi/10.2105/AJPH.2022.307018>
* Harald Schmidt : California also one of leaders of using disadvantage indices in lockdown and vaccines: <https://www.healthyplacesindex.org>
* Yoshitaka Ota : In many cases, the choice can be between death by covid or death by economic loss for those are vulnerable and politically less represented. Perhaps the link is not clear but the increase of suicide rate in Japan certainly increased after COVID.
* Harald Schmidt : SVI includes race: <https://www.atsdr.cdc.gov/placeandhealth/svi/index.html>
* Jade Berry James : A working paper about deprivation of indices, <https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/working-papers/2020/demo/SEHSD-WP2020-08.pdf>
* Harald Schmidt : Larry Gostin, Michelle Williams and I explored whether better to include race/not here: <https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama/fullarticle/2771874>
* Is It Lawful and Ethical to Prioritize Racial Minorities for COVID-19 Vaccines?
* Blue Wooldridge : NAPA has published an edited volume, edited by Fellow Norman Johnson and James Svera "Justice for All" I would guess that NAPA has some copies left.
* Jade Berry James : Read all about it: McLennan's Indices of Deprivation published by University of Oxford, <https://www.oecd.org/regional/regional-policy/50587193.pdf>
* Jade Berry James : See "Leadership in a crisis: Responding to the coronavirus outbreak and future challenges by D'Auria and De Smet (Mar 2020)https://www.mckinsey.com/capabilities/people-and-organizational-performance/our-insights/leadership-in-a-crisis-responding-to-the-coronavirus-outbreak-and-future-challenges
* Jade Berry James : Read all about it: "State of Oregon Equity Framework in COVID-19 Response and Recovery" <https://www.oregon.gov/pharmacy/Documents/EquityFrameworkCovid19_2020.pdf>
* Harald Schmidt : Agree that no natl policy in trump admin—but different with Biden/Harris, see eg https://www.whitehouse.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/NAT-COVID-19-PREPAREDNESS-PLAN.pdf (includes use of SVI, too, in various ways)—that was (and is, in many parts) dovetailing of natl—state-county….
* Jade Berry James : Read more from the National Academies Sciences, Engineering and Medicine "A Framework for Equity Allocation of Vaccine for the Novel Coronavirus" <https://www.nationalacademies.org/our-work/a-framework-for-equitable-allocation-of-vaccine-for-the-novel-coronavirus>
* Blue Wooldridge : Dan/Jade/Elsie/Louise/Mary Kee/Harald/Wenjuan What a wonderful informative presentation for our first collaboration. As Rick said at the end of Casablanca, "may this be the beginning of a beautiful friendship!'' Thanks,
* Harald Schmidt : On global level work on recognizing intersectionality of disadvantage, and cumulative and typically corrosive impact, see WHO discussion paper here: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240031852) and UNDP 2021 2021 GLOBAL MULTIDIMENSIONAL POVERTY INDEX (MPI) focusing on race/ethnicity/gender “Unmasking disparities by ethnicity, caste and gender” <https://hdr.undp.org/content/2021-global-multidimensional-poverty-index-mpi>
* Jade Berry James : In JAMA, "Deaths in Nursing Homes During the COVID-19 Pandemic - Lessons from Japan" <https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jama-health-forum/fullarticle/2776556>
* Yoshitaka Ota : thank you. Please call me YOSHI..
* Jade Berry James : Learn about the South Africa Situation from WHO South Africa, <https://covid19.who.int/region/afro/country/za>
* Jade Berry James : More data from worldometer South Africa, <https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/country/south-africa/>
* Jade Berry James : Read about KFF COVID-19 Cases and Deaths by Race/Ethnicity: Current Data and Changes Over Time, <https://www.kff.org/coronavirus-covid-19/issue-brief/covid-19-cases-and-deaths-by-race-ethnicity-current-data-and-changes-over-time/>
* Jade Berry James : According to Gooden (2014), "social equity -- specifically racial equity -- is a nervous area of government." Read all about it, <https://www.routledge.com/Race-and-Social-Equity-A-Nervous-Area-of-Government/Gooden/p/book/9780765637192#:~:text=In%20this%20compelling%20book%20the,of%20racial%20inequities%20in%20government>.
* Yoshitaka Ota : we need to consider the importance of ‘intersectionality’ when we seek for data on ethnicity and race.
* Stephen Pellegrino : thank you Gen Fields!
* Yoshitaka Ota : Equity Action is ‘to discredit disruptive interpretation that would strip right and advantage of peoples’
* Yoshitaka Ota : <https://direct.mit.edu/ajle/article/doi/10.1162/ajle_a_00019/107229/EQUALITY-VS-EQUITY>
* Côme Joly : On the reason of the illegality of racial data collection in France and Germany, and its impacts on coronavirus policies. https://www.newyorker.com/news/news-desk/can-the-french-talk-about-racehttps://www.washingtonpost.com/world/europe/coronavirus-france-race-data/2020/06/25/e5b4d0a6-b58d-11ea-9a1d-d3db1cbe07ce\_story.html <https://aninjusticemag.com/why-is-it-illegal-to-collect-data-on-race-in-france-e02cf5ddfa4a>
* Harald Schmidt : on a data on race and equity, here is a (depressing, and accurate—and depressing) table on intersection of race and class: Minnesota Department of Health. COVID-19 Vaccine Equity Metric Evaluation Brief
* <https://www.health.state.mn.us/diseases/coronavirus/vaccine/mnsvivaxbrief.pdf>
	+ and can help sidestep the thorny issues, which addressing racial justice head-on
* Harald Schmidt : table 1
* Yoshitaka Ota : I just wanted emphasize the importance of ‘story telling’ as a part of Data as it is essential for equity conversation and policy designs.